

**VIA ECF**

The Honorable Arun Subramanian  
 United States District Court for the Southern District of New York  
 500 Pearl Street, Courtroom 15A  
 New York, NY 10007-1312

June 30, 2025

**Re: *United States et al. v. Live Nation Entertainment, Inc. et al.*; 1:24-cv-03973-AS-SLC**

Dear Judge Subramanian:

Plaintiffs write pursuant to the Court’s June 27 Order and in response to Defendants’ motion to compel non-party SeatGeek, Inc. (“SeatGeek”) to produce text and Slack messages (“the Motion”) (ECF No. 586). Defendants argue in their Motion that the sought-after texts and Slack messages are “critical” to their case; yet, Defendants waited until the end of fact discovery—and after five of six SeatGeek depositions—to seek this relief. Plaintiffs take no position on the substantive merits of Defendants’ Motion but oppose it to the extent that any relief Defendants seek in their late-filed Motion causes prejudice to Plaintiffs.

As an initial matter, Defendants negotiated their 89-request document subpoena to SeatGeek directly with SeatGeek. Plaintiffs did not participate in any of those negotiations or in the meet-and-confers between SeatGeek and Defendants regarding the production of text or Slack messages.<sup>1</sup>

Having timely served their own discovery requests on SeatGeek, Plaintiffs (like Defendants) also received SeatGeek’s rolling productions in May and June. Plaintiffs proceeded to take five cross-noticed depositions of SeatGeek witnesses between May 27 and June 11.<sup>2</sup> At no point before these depositions did Defendants alert Plaintiffs of any concerns that SeatGeek had not produced “critical” documents.

Defendants could have raised these production issues much earlier than their June 25 Motion. This is not an instance where the existence of these text or Slack messages were newly-discovered by Defendants over the course of the five SeatGeek depositions. For example, Defendants’ Exhibit C is a text message exchange produced during the investigation. Plaintiffs produced that document to Defendants in August 2024, and Defendants’ counsel questioned the custodian of that document about it at his May 22 deposition. And, as Defendants acknowledge in their Motion, SeatGeek produced text and Slack messages in the investigation; Plaintiffs produced

<sup>1</sup> The reference to “Plaintiffs” in footnote 1 of Defendants’ Motion is inaccurate. Plaintiffs did not attend—nor were Plaintiffs invited to—the June 10, 13, or 19 meet-and-confers between Defendants and SeatGeek.

<sup>2</sup> Defendants also contrast their production of text messages for 55 custodians to SeatGeek’s production. But, such a comparison is inapposite for many reasons—not the least of which being that Defendants are a party to this litigation and SeatGeek is a non-party.

those same documents to Defendants in August 2024. In other words, Defendants were fully aware of the existence of potentially responsive text and Slack messages by SeatGeek executives many months ago. Yet, they chose to move forward with five SeatGeek depositions without those documents and without alerting Plaintiffs that this dispute was brewing.

The relief sought in Defendants' Motion has the potential to unduly prejudice Plaintiffs, who have diligently taken depositions and sought discovery from non-parties. Plaintiffs allocated their deposition time for the SeatGeek witnesses with the understanding that document productions for those SeatGeek witnesses were substantially complete. Further, the timing of any such production may unduly hinder Plaintiffs' ability to use those documents, and any subsequent deposition testimony, in their expert reports.<sup>3</sup>

For the foregoing reasons, Plaintiffs respectfully request that if the Court grants the Motion, it also order that: (1) any deposition time spent by Plaintiffs on any newly-produced SeatGeek documents will not count against Plaintiffs' 300-hour allotment (but any deposition time spent by Defendants on these documents would count against Defendants' deposition allotment); (2) Plaintiffs will be able to supplement Plaintiffs' expert reports to account for any newly-produced SeatGeek documents; and (3) any such production will not otherwise impact the schedule.

Respectfully submitted,  
*/s/ Bonny Sweeney*  
 BONNY SWEENEY  
*Lead Trial Counsel*

United States Department of Justice  
 Antitrust Division  
 450 Fifth Street N.W., Suite 4000  
 Washington, DC 20530  
 Telephone: (202) 702-0537  
 Bonny.Sweeney@usdoj.gov

*Attorney for Plaintiff United States of America*

---

<sup>3</sup> Finally, Plaintiffs disagree with many, if not all, of Defendants' characterizations of SeatGeek's role in this case, as well as Defendants' cherry-picked deposition excerpts and documents. It is unnecessary for purposes of this Motion to address that here.

/s/ Robert A. Bernheim

Robert A. Bernheim (admitted *pro hac vice*)  
Office of the Arizona Attorney General  
Consumer Protection & Advocacy Section  
2005 N. Central Avenue  
Phoenix, AZ 85004  
Telephone: (602) 542-3725  
Fax: (602) 542-4377  
Email: Robert.Bernheim@azag.gov  
*Attorney for Plaintiff State of Arizona*

/s/ Amanda J. Wentz

Amanda J. Wentz (admitted *pro hac vice*)  
Assistant Attorney General  
Office of the Arkansas Attorney General  
101 West Capitol Avenue  
Little Rock, AR 72201  
Telephone: (501) 682-1178  
Fax: (501) 682-8118  
Email: amanda.wentz@arkansasag.gov  
*Attorney for Plaintiff State of Arkansas*

/s/ Paula Lauren Gibson

Paula Lauren Gibson (admitted *pro hac vice*)  
Deputy Attorney General  
(CA Bar No. 100780)  
Office of the Attorney General  
California Department of Justice  
300 South Spring Street, Suite 1702  
Los Angeles, CA 90013  
Telephone: (213) 269-6040  
Email: paula.gibson@doj.ca.gov  
*Attorney for Plaintiff State of California*

/s/ Conor J. May

Conor J. May (admitted *pro hac vice*)  
Assistant Attorney General  
Antitrust Unit  
Colorado Department of Law  
1300 Broadway, 7th Floor  
Denver, CO 80203  
Telephone: (720) 508-6000  
Email: Conor.May@coag.gov  
*Attorney for Plaintiff State of Colorado*

/s/ Kim Carlson McGee

Kim Carlson McGee (admitted *pro hac vice*)  
Assistant Attorney General  
Office of the Attorney General of  
Connecticut  
165 Capitol Avenue  
Hartford, CT 06106  
Telephone: 860-808-5030  
Email: kim.mcgee@ct.gov  
*Attorney for Plaintiff State of Connecticut*

/s/ Elizabeth G. Arthur

Elizabeth G. Arthur (admitted *pro hac vice*)  
Senior Assistant Attorney General  
Office of the Attorney General for the  
District of Columbia  
400 6<sup>th</sup> Street NW, 10<sup>th</sup> Floor  
Washington, DC 20001  
Email: Elizabeth.arthur@dc.gov  
*Attorney for Plaintiff District of Columbia*

/s/ Lizabeth A. Brady

Lizabeth A. Brady  
Director, Antitrust Division  
Florida Office of the Attorney General  
PL-01 The Capitol  
Tallahassee, FL 32399-1050  
Telephone: 850-414-3300  
Email: Liz.Brady@myfloridalegal.com  
*Attorney for Plaintiff State of Florida*

/s/ Richard S. Schultz

Richard S. Schultz (Admitted *pro hac vice*)  
Assistant Attorney General  
Office of the Illinois Attorney General  
Antitrust Bureau  
115 S. LaSalle Street, Floor 23  
Chicago, Illinois 60603  
Telephone: (872) 272-0996  
Email: Richard.Schultz@ilag.gov  
*Attorney for Plaintiff State of Illinois*

/s/ Jesse Moore

Jesse Moore (admitted *pro hac vice*)  
Deputy Attorney General  
Office of the Indiana Attorney General  
302 W. Washington St., Fifth Floor  
Indianapolis, IN 46204  
Telephone: 317-232-4956  
Email: Jesse.Moore@atg.in.gov  
*Attorney for Plaintiff State of Indiana*

/s/ Noah Goerlitz

Noah Goerlitz (admitted *pro hac vice*)  
Assistant Attorney General  
Office of the Iowa Attorney General  
1305 E. Walnut St.  
Des Moines, IA 50319  
Telephone: (515) 281-5164  
Email: noah.goerlitz@ag.iowa.gov  
*Attorney for Plaintiff State of Iowa*

/s/ Christopher Teters

Christopher Teters (admitted *pro hac vice*)  
Assistant Attorney General  
Public Protection Division  
Office of Kansas Attorney General  
120 S.W. 10th Avenue, 2nd Floor  
Topeka, KS 66612-1597  
Telephone: (785) 296-3751  
Email: chris.teters@ag.ks.gov  
*Attorney for Plaintiff State of Kansas*

/s/ Mario Guadamud

Mario Guadamud (*admitted pro hac vice*)  
Louisiana Office of Attorney General  
1885 North Third Street  
Baton Rouge, LA 70802  
Telephone: (225) 326-6400  
Fax: (225) 326-6498  
Email: GuadamudM@ag.louisiana.gov  
*Attorney for Plaintiff State of Louisiana*

/s/ Schonette J. Walker

Schonette J. Walker (admitted *pro hac vice*)  
Assistant Attorney General  
Chief, Antitrust Division  
200 St. Paul Place, 19th floor  
Baltimore, Maryland 21202  
Telephone: (410) 576-6470  
Email: swalker@oag.state.md.us  
*Attorney for Plaintiff State of Maryland*

/s/ Katherine W. Krems

Katherine W. Krems (admitted *pro hac vice*)  
Assistant Attorney General, Antitrust  
Division  
Office of the Massachusetts Attorney  
General  
One Ashburton Place, 18th Floor  
Boston, MA 02108  
Telephone: (617) 963-2189  
Email: Katherine.Krems@mass.gov  
*Attorney for Plaintiff Commonwealth of  
Massachusetts*

/s/ LeAnn D. Scott

LeAnn D. Scott (admitted *pro hac vice*)  
Assistant Attorney General  
Corporate Oversight Division  
Michigan Department of Attorney General  
P.O. Box 30736  
Lansing, MI 48909  
Telephone: (517) 335-7632  
Email: ScottL21@michigan.gov  
*Attorney for Plaintiff State of Michigan*

/s/ Zach Biesanz

Zach Biesanz  
Senior Enforcement Counsel  
Antitrust Division  
Office of the Minnesota Attorney General  
445 Minnesota Street, Suite 1400  
Saint Paul, MN 55101  
Telephone: (651) 757-1257  
Email: zach.biesanz@ag.state.mn.us  
*Attorney for Plaintiff State of Minnesota*

/s/ Lee Morris

Lee Morris (admitted pro hac vice)  
Special Assistant Attorney General  
Mississippi Office of Attorney General  
Post Office Box 220  
Jackson, Mississippi 39205  
Telephone: (601) 359-9011  
Email: Lee.Morris@ago.ms.gov  
*Attorney for Plaintiff State of Mississippi*

/s/ Justin C. McCully

Justin C. McCully (admitted pro hac vice)  
Assistant Attorney General  
Consumer Protection Bureau  
Office of the Nebraska Attorney General  
2115 State Capitol  
Lincoln, NE 68509  
Telephone: (402) 471-9305  
Email: justin.mccully@nebraska.gov  
*Attorney for Plaintiff State of Nebraska*

/s/ Lucas J. Tucker

Lucas J. Tucker (admitted pro hac vice)  
Senior Deputy Attorney General  
Office of the Nevada Attorney General  
Bureau of Consumer Protection  
100 N. Carson St.  
Carson City, NV 89701  
Email: ltucker@ag.nv.gov  
*Attorney for Plaintiff State of Nevada*

/s/ Zachary Frish

Zachary A. Frish (admitted *pro hac vice*)  
Assistant Attorney General  
Consumer Protection & Antitrust Bureau  
New Hampshire Attorney General's Office  
Department of Justice  
1 Granite Place South  
Concord, NH 03301  
Telephone: (603) 271-2150  
Email: zachary.a.frish@doj.nh.gov  
*Attorney for Plaintiff State of New Hampshire*

/s/ Andrew F. Esoldi

Andrew F. Esoldi  
Deputy Attorney General  
Division of Law  
Antitrust Litigation and Competition  
Enforcement  
124 Halsey Street, 5th Floor  
Newark, NJ 07101  
Telephone: (609) 696-5465  
Email: Andrew.Esoldi@law.njoag.gov  
*Attorney for Plaintiff State of New Jersey*

/s/ Jonathan Hatch

Jonathan Hatch  
Assistant Attorney General  
New York State Office of the Attorney  
General  
28 Liberty Street  
New York, NY 10005  
Telephone: (212) 416-8598  
Email: jonathan.hatch@ag.ny.gov  
*Attorney for Plaintiff State of New York*

/s/ Evan Crocker

Evan Crocker (*pro hac vice pending*)  
Assistant Attorney General, Division  
Director  
Consumer Affairs Division  
New Mexico Department of Justice  
201 3<sup>rd</sup> St NW, Suite 300  
Albuquerque, NM 87102  
Telephone: (505) 494-8973  
Email: ecrocker@nmdoj.gov  
*Attorney for Plaintiff State of New Mexico*

/s/ Brian D. Rabinovitz

Brian D. Rabinovitz (admitted *pro hac vice*)  
Special Deputy Attorney General  
North Carolina Department of Justice  
Post Office Box 629  
Raleigh, North Carolina 27602  
Telephone: (919) 716-6000  
Facsimile: (919) 716-6050  
Email: brabinovitz@ncdoj.gov  
*Attorney for Plaintiff State of North Carolina*

/s/ Sarah Mader

Sarah Mader (admitted *pro hac vice*)  
Assistant Attorney General  
Antitrust Section  
Office of the Ohio Attorney General  
30 E. Broad St., 26th Floor  
Columbus, OH 43215  
Telephone: (614) 466-4328  
Email: Sarah.Mader@OhioAGO.gov  
*Attorney for Plaintiff State of Ohio*

/s/ Cameron R. Capps

Cameron R. Capps (admitted *pro hac vice*)  
Deputy Attorney General  
Consumer Protection  
Office of the Oklahoma Attorney General  
313 N.E. 21st Street  
Oklahoma City, Oklahoma 73105  
Telephone: (405) 522-0858  
Fax: (405) 522-0085  
Email: Cameron.Capps@oag.ok.gov  
*Attorney for Plaintiff State of Oklahoma*

/s/ Gina Ko

Gina Ko (admitted *pro hac vice*)  
Assistant Attorney General  
Antitrust, False Claims, and Privacy  
Section  
Oregon Department of Justice  
100 SW Market St.,  
Portland, Oregon 97201  
Telephone: (971) 673-1880  
Fax: (503) 378-5017  
Email: Gina.Ko@doj.oregon.gov  
*Attorney for Plaintiff State of Oregon*

/s/ Joseph S. Betsko

Joseph S. Betsko (admitted *pro hac vice*)  
Assistant Chief Deputy Attorney General  
Antitrust Section  
Pennsylvania Office of Attorney General  
Strawberry Square, 14th Floor  
Harrisburg, PA 17120  
Telephone: (717) 787-4530  
Email: jbetsko@attorneygeneral.gov  
*Attorney for Plaintiff Commonwealth of Pennsylvania*

/s/ Paul T.J. Meosky

Paul T.J. Meosky (admitted *pro hac vice*)  
Special Assistant Attorney General  
150 South Main Street  
Providence, RI 02903  
Telephone: (401) 274-4400, ext. 2064  
Fax: (401) 222-2995  
Email: pmeosky@riag.ri.gov  
*Attorney for Plaintiff State of Rhode Island*

/s/ Danielle A. Robertson

Danielle A. Robertson (admitted *pro hac vice*)  
Assistant Attorney General  
Office of the Attorney General of South Carolina  
P.O. Box 11549  
Columbia, South Carolina 29211  
Telephone: (803) 734-0274  
Email: DaniRobertson@scag.gov  
*Attorney for Plaintiff State of South Carolina*

/s/ Bret Leigh Nance

Bret Leigh Nance (admitted *pro hac vice*)  
Assistant Attorney General  
1302 E. Hwy 14, Suite 1  
Pierre SD 57501-8501  
Email: bretleigh.nance@state.sd.us  
Telephone: (605) 773-3215  
Bar # 5613  
*Attorney for Plaintiff State of South Dakota*

/s/ Hamilton Millwee

Hamilton Millwee (admitted *pro hac vice*)  
Assistant Attorney General  
Office of the Attorney General and  
Reporter  
P.O. Box 20207  
Nashville, TN 38202  
Telephone: (615) 291-5922  
Email: Hamilton.Millwee@ag.tn.gov  
*Attorney for Plaintiff State of Tennessee*

/s/ Diamante Smith

Diamante Smith (admitted *pro hac vice*)  
Assistant Attorney General, Antitrust  
Division  
Office of the Attorney General of Texas  
P.O. Box 12548  
Austin, TX 78711-2548  
Telephone: (512) 936-1162  
*Attorney for Plaintiff State of Texas*

/s/ Marie W.L. Martin

Marie W.L. Martin (admitted *pro hac vice*)  
Deputy Division Director,  
Antitrust & Data Privacy Division  
Utah Office of Attorney General  
160 East 300 South, 5<sup>th</sup> Floor  
P.O. Box 140830  
Salt Lake City, UT 84114-0830  
Telephone: 801-366-0375  
Email: mwmartin@ag.utah.gov  
*Attorney for Plaintiff State of Utah*

/s/ Sarah L. J. Aceves

Sarah L. J. Aceves (admitted *pro hac vice*)  
Assistant Attorney General  
Consumer Protection and Antitrust Unit  
Vermont Attorney General's Office  
109 State Street  
Montpelier, VT 05609  
Telephone: (802) 828-3170  
Email: sarah.aceves@vermont.gov  
*Attorney for Plaintiff State of Vermont*

/s/ David C. Smith

David C. Smith (admitted *pro hac vice*)  
Assistant Attorney General  
Office of the Attorney General of Virginia  
202 North 9<sup>th</sup> Street  
Richmond, Virginia 23219  
Telephone: (804) 692-0588  
Facsimile: (804) 786-0122  
Email: dsmith@oag.state.va.us  
*Attorney for Plaintiff Commonwealth of Virginia*

/s/ Ashley A. Locke

Ashley A. Locke (admitted *pro hac vice*)  
Assistant Attorney General  
Antitrust Division  
Washington Office of the Attorney General  
800 Fifth Avenue, Suite 2000  
Seattle, WA 98104-3188  
Telephone: (206) 389-2420  
Email: Ashley.Locke@atg.wa.gov  
*Attorney for Plaintiff State of Washington*

/s/ Douglas L. Davis

Douglas L. Davis (admitted *pro hac vice*)  
Senior Assistant Attorney General  
Consumer Protection and Antitrust Section  
West Virginia Office of Attorney General  
P.O. Box 1789  
Charleston, WV 25326  
Telephone: (304) 558-8986  
Fax: (304) 558-0184  
Email: douglas.l.davis@wvago.gov  
*Attorney for Plaintiff State of West Virginia*

/s/ Caitlin M. Madden

Caitlin M. Madden (admitted *pro hac vice*)  
Assistant Attorney General  
Wisconsin Department of Justice  
Post Office Box 7857  
Madison, WI 53707-7857  
Telephone: (608) 267-1311  
Email: caitlin.madden@wisdoj.gov  
*Attorney for Plaintiff State of Wisconsin*

/s/ William T. Young

William T. Young  
Assistant Attorney General  
Wyoming Attorney General's Office  
109 State Capitol  
Cheyenne, WY 82002  
Telephone: (307) 777-7847  
Email: william.young@wyo.gov  
*Attorney for the Plaintiff State of Wyoming*